
NYISO Business Issues Committee Meeting Minutes
November 15, 2017
10:00 a.m. – 2:15 p.m.

1. Introductions, Meeting Objectives, and Chairman's Report

Mr. Scott Butler (Con Edison) called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. by welcoming the members of the BIC. The members of the BIC identified themselves and attendance was recorded. A quorum was determined.

2. Approval of BIC Minutes

There were no comments or questions regarding the draft meeting minutes for the October 11, 2017 BIC meeting that were included with the meeting material.

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the October 11, 2017 BIC meeting minutes.

Motion passed unanimously with an abstention.

3. Market Operations Report and Broader Regional Markets Report

Mr. Rana Mukerji (NYISO) reviewed the Market Operations report posted with the meeting material. There were no questions or comments.

Mr. Mukerji reviewed the Broader Regional Markets report included with the meeting material. Mr. Howard Fromer (PSEG) requested clarification regarding the status of the proposed changes to the documentation requirements for capacity imports over the PJM AC ties that were presented at the ICAPWG. Mr. Mukerji stated that the NYISO's currently plans to make the changes to such documentation requirements effective for May 1, 2018.

4. 2017-2018 BIC Vice Chair Election – Kelli Joseph NRG

Ms. Kelli Joseph (NRG) was elected Vice Chair of BIC for 2017-2018.

5. Alternative Methods for Determining LCRs: Final Market Design

Mr. Zachary Stines (NYISO) reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material. Mr. Mark Younger (Hudson Energy Economics) asked whether the proposal would utilize collared or uncollared net cost of new entry (CONE) values in performing the optimization. Mr. Stines replied that this issue will be addressed as part of the tariff development process for the project in 2018. Mr. David Allen (NYISO) noted that the collaring mechanism is transitional and sunsets after the 2020/2021 Capability Year. Mr. Chris Hargett (Con Edison) agreed that this issue should be addressed as part of the process to develop tariff revisions to accompany the proposal in 2018.

Mr. John Borchert (Central Hudson) asked whether the analysis done to date had used collared or un-collared net CONE values. Mr. Stines explained that the analysis completed to date has utilized the data and information related to the 2017-2018 Capability Year ICAP Demand Curves for which the collaring mechanism does not apply.

Mr. Jim D'Andrea (Ravenswood) raised concerns that optimizing Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirements (LCRs) to achieve the lowest possible statewide capacity cost increases risks for investors and recommended that the NYISO, instead, focus efforts on addressing other capacity market initiatives to ensure that capacity market price signals are correct. Mr. Stines stated that the NYISO's analysis does indicate that the proposal may provide overall capacity cost savings for consumers, but noted that the proposal is also intended to provide greater stability, transparency and predictability with respect to establishing LCR values, which should be beneficial to both consumers and investors.

Mr. David Clarke (LIPA) provided the following statement for the minutes:

Power Supply LI strongly opposes NYISO's Alternative LCR proposal. We believe the NYISO has advanced this project without fully considering the ramifications of, and alternatives to, the advocated approach. For Long Island (and perhaps other zones), the proposed methodology will result in a significant misalignment of costs and beneficiaries. Since the NYISO has refused to fully study and report on the implications of its proposed methodology, LSEs are now being asked to approve this methodology with inadequate supporting information. For example, our own preliminary analysis of this methodology suggests that it is based on an unrealistically low assumption as to the cost of new capacity on LI. Further, our modeling has identified anomalies where installed capacity exceeding LI peak load will contribute more to reliability than capacity added, for example in NYC, where installed capacity requirements are below 81% of peak load. This mismatch means that reliability benefits from increases in the LCR on LI will not accrue predominately to LI customers. Instead, there will be a direct subsidization of NYC by the LI LCR. There has been no showing by the NYISO that such a result is appropriate—much less a result that would be consistent with beneficiaries pay principles. Power Supply LI also is concerned that this new methodology could result in LCRs at levels that may cause additional cost relative to current procedures, if NYC fails to meet its minimum requirement and capacity additions elsewhere are required. These are just a few examples and we have other concerns as well. Simply, a change of this magnitude must be more fully vetted and LSEs deserve a full accounting from the NYISO of all aspects of its proposed implementation and consideration of alternatives that achieve a more balanced refinement of the LCR methodology.

Mr. D'Andrea questioned whether the proposal needs to be reviewed by the Operating Committee to ensure that it does not present any reliability concerns. Mr. Borchert stated that there did not appear to be any need for Operating Committee review because the proposal expressly requires that the 0.1 loss of load expectation (LOLE) be maintained in establishing LCRs. Mr. Mayer Sasson (Con Edison) stated that the proposal is intended to produce more stable LCRs which is beneficial to the market generally, including investors. Mr. Sasson also stated that because both the current LCR methodology and the proposal ensure that the 0.1 LOLE criteria is maintained there does not appear to be any reliability implications that require further consideration by the Operating Committee.

Mr. Younger asked if the current plan, assuming approval of the proposal, was to implement the new methodology for determined LCRs for the 2019-2020 Capability Year. Mr. Stines confirmed that Mr. Younger's understanding of the planned implementation was correct. Mr. Younger commended the NYISO on all the analysis done to date, but stated he would like to see NYISO commit to provide additional analysis utilizing the 2018 Installed Reserve Margin (IRM) base case data, updated transmission security limit values, and data from the 2018-2019 Capability Year ICAP Demand Curves. Mr. Mukerji stated that the NYISO would try to complete an updated analysis in advance of seeking stakeholder approval in 2018 of tariff revisions to implement the proposal.

Mr. Hargett provided the following statement for the minutes:

Con Edison and Orange & Rockland appreciate the NYISO's efforts on this complex issue. While recognizing that we have additional work to do early next year, we can support this proposal today because of the inclusion of a Transmission Security Level that considers the reliability needs of the system while producing more stable and predictable LCRs. It should address the reliability concerns Con Edison expressed about this project. We thank NYISO staff for working with us and other stakeholders on this creative solution.

Mr. Borchert expressed Central Hudson's support for the proposal noting that the proposal: (i) appears to address concerns related to the potential for counterintuitive results from changes in generation that have been experienced under the current methodology for determining LCRs; and (ii) provides greater stability in LCR values and improves capacity market price signals in comparison to the current methodology for determining LCRs.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby approves the market design, as presented at today’s BIC, subject to the resolution of the issue presented concerning the net cost of new entry curve to be used in instances when the collar mechanism is triggered, and requests that the NYISO develop a tariff proposal, with input from the Installed Capacity Working Group (“ICAP Working Group”), to implement the Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirement Optimization Methodology and return to BIC and MC for discussion and action.

Motion passed with 81.1% affirmative votes.

6. IPP Project Update

Mr. Mike DeSocio (NYISO) reviewed the presentation included with the meeting material.

Mr. Kevin Lang (Couch White) and Mr. Jay Brew (Nucor) expressed concerns regarding the need to ensure for consideration of alternative methods other than carbon pricing in the wholesale energy market for harmonizing wholesale markets with State public policies. Mr. Lang also stated that this initiative must consider the need for additional transmission to increase the capability to flow power between upstate and downstate.

Mr. Lang and Mr. Brew noted concerns regarding the proposed charter for the Integrating Public Policy Task Force (IPPTF) and the scope of work to be undertaken by the task force. Mr. DeSocio clarified that the IPPTF is intended to provide a forum for providing an initial examination of carbon pricing in the wholesale markets and issues/considerations relating thereto, as well as alternatives that seek to leverage wholesale markets to further assist with the achievement of the State’s carbon emissions reduction goals.

Ms. Joseph (NRG) stated that carbon pricing in the wholesale energy market needs to be complemented by other initiatives, including potential revisions to the capacity market.

Mr. Brew stated that it is important to clearly define the role and intended scope of efforts to be undertaken through the IPPTF. Mr. Michael Mager (Couch White) and Mr. Lang raised concerns regarding the need to avoid unnecessary duplication of efforts by reviewing issues at both MIWG/ICAPWG and IPPTF. Ms. Doreen Saia (Greenburg Traurig) recommended that the NYISO develop a very clear framework to outline the scope of efforts that will be addressed through MIWG/ICAPWG in 2018 in order to help clarify the roles of MIWG/ICAPWG and IPPTF. Mr. DeSocio clarified that the IPPTF is intended to be a forum for considering only one aspect of the NYISO’s broader public policy integration efforts – the capability of leveraging the wholesale markets to assist in achieving the State’s carbon emission reduction goals – while other initiatives focused on the assessing any changes needed to wholesale market rules, products and structures in response to the State’s energy policy goals and Clean Energy Standard will be considered at MIWG/ICAPWG. Mr. DeSocio noted that a draft work plan will be developed in early 2018 that will help to clarify the scope of efforts being undertaken through the IPPTF. Mr. Rich Dewey (NYISO) clarified that IPPTF will not supplant the normal stakeholder governance process. Mr. Dewey stated that the task force was developed as a way to allow people to get involved that don’t typically participate in NYISO governance. Mr. Dewey further noted that the ultimate goal is to use the task force to maximize stakeholder input as part of the efforts to develop a proposal for further consideration through the normal NYISO governance process.

Mr. DeSocio stated that the NYISO intends to develop an initial list of potential initiatives for discussion at the December 5, 2017 MIWG meeting related to the broader efforts to integrate the State’s public policies into the wholesale markets. Mr. DeSocio further noted that an expanded list of potential initiatives for consideration would be identified in the Integrating Public Policy White Paper that the NYISO plans to post by the end of the year. The intent is for this to serve as a starting point for discussions with stakeholders in early 2018 to identify high priority market design concepts that should be further pursued through MIWG/ICAPWG in the near-term.

7. Working Group Updates

- Billing and Accounting and Credit Working Group – The group met on October 23, 2017 and reviewed the standard accounting/settlement reports.
- Electric System Planning Working Group – ESWPG has met twice since the last BIC meeting. The group met on October 26, 2017 and reviewed key study assumptions for the Binghamton power plant generator deactivation assessment, Local Transmission Plan updates, 2017 CARIS Phase I updated benchmark and base case results, an update on historic congestion data reporting, an update on proposed changes to the RNA base case inclusion rules and lessons learned from Western NY public policy transmission planning process. The group also met on November 3, 2017 and reviewed Local Transmission Plan updates.
- Installed Capacity Working Group – ICAPWG has met three times since the last BIC meeting. The group met on October 11, 2017 and reviewed the on ramps and off ramps proposal, the consumer impact analysis for alternative methodologies for determining LCRs, and deliverability requirement for capacity imports and a proposed change to the documentation requirements for imports over the PJM AC ties. On October 24, 2017, the group met and reviewed the on ramps and off ramps proposal, a proposal regarding awarding CRIS to entities that increase transfer capability into Rest of State from an external Control Area and updated gross cost of new entry data related to the annual update of the ICAP Demand Curves for the 2018-2019 Capability Year. The group also met on November 6, 2017 and reviewed the final results of the annual update of the ICAP Demand Curves for the 2018-2019 Capability Year, the Performance Assurance Study conducted by Analysis Group, a supplement to the consumer impact analysis for alternative methodologies for determining LCRs, the consumer impact analysis for the on ramps and off ramps proposal and the on ramps and off ramps proposal.
- Electric Gas Coordination Working Group – The group has not met since the last BIC meeting.
- Load Forecasting Task Force – The group met on October 23, 2017 and reviewed Moody's Analytics' national and New York economic outlooks.
- Market Issues Working Group – The group has met three times since the last BIC meeting. On October 16, 2017, the group met and reviewed the NY wind overview and 2016 operation report, and the market impact assessment being conducted as part of the Integrating Public Policy initiative. On October 30, 2017, the group met and reviewed alternative methods for LCRs, distributed energy resources (DER) aggregations and dual participation and initial findings from the DER meter data study. The group also met on November 2, 2017 and reviewed the consumer impact analysis for securing 100+kV transmission facilities in the market model, energy storage integration and optimization, the large scale solar participation model, proposed revisions to the current price correction deadlines and a presentation by NRG regarding potential market reforms for consideration as part of the Integrating Public Policy initiative.
- Price Responsive Load Working Group – The group met jointly with the MIWG on October 30, 2017 and reviewed the DER-related topics.

8. New Business

Mr. Younger requested an update regarding the status of the Indian Point generator deactivation assessment. Mr. Dewey stated that the NYISO is currently seeking complete the assessment by the end of December 2017.

Meeting adjourned at 2:15 p.m.

Business Issues Committee
November 15, 2017
Final Motions

Motion #1:

Motion to approve the Minutes of the October 11, 2017 BIC meeting.

Motion passed unanimously with an abstention.

Motion #2:

The Business Issues Committee (“BIC”) hereby approves the market design, as presented at today’s BIC, subject to the resolution of the issue presented concerning the net cost of new entry curve to be used in instances when the collar mechanism is triggered, and requests that the NYISO develop a tariff proposal, with input from the Installed Capacity Working Group (“ICAP Working Group”), to implement the Locational Minimum Installed Capacity Requirement Optimization Methodology and return to BIC and MC for discussion and action.

Motion passed with 81.1% affirmative votes.

***Kelli Joseph (NRG) was elected Vice-Chair for 2017-2018.*

New York Independent System Operator
Business Issues Committee - November 15, 2017

Motion: Motion #1

Result: Motion Passed

Sector with base percent	%	Active	Quorum	Adj. Percent	For	Against	Abstain	% For	% Against	
Generation Owners	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	3.00	2.00	1.00	12.90	8.60	
Other Suppliers	21.50	✓	✓	21.50	6.00	0.00	5.00	21.50	0.00	
Transmission Owners	20.00	✓	✓	20.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	
End Use Consumer			✓							
Large Consumer	9.00	✓		9.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	15.50	0.00	
Large Cons. Gov. Agency	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Small Consumer	4.50	✓	✓	4.50	0.00	0.00	6.00	0.00	0.00	
Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	2.70	✓		2.70	1.00	0.00	0.00	2.70	0.00	
Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	1.80	✓		1.80	2.00	0.00	0.00	1.80	0.00	
Public Power			✓							
State Power Authorities	8.00	✓		8.00	1.00	1.00	0.00	4.53	4.53	
Munis & Co-ops	7.00	✓		7.00	3.00	8.00	0.00	2.16	5.77	
Environmental	2.00	✓		2.00	0.00	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.00	
				5	100.00	25.00	11.00	13.00	81.09	18.90
					100.00	Normalize to 100% :		81.1	18.9	

New York Independent System Operator

Business Issues Committee - November 15, 2017

Motion: Motion #1

Result: Motion Passed

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Generation Owners	Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Astoria Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Calpine		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	CPV Valley LLC	Litchfield, Matt	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Generation Owners	East Coast Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Saia, Doreen	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Innovative Energy Systems		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Noble Environmental Power LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	EDP Renewables North America LLC	High, Jeremy	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Cricket Valley Energy Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Invenergy Energy Management LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	National Grid Generation LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Goodenough, Jeery	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Howard Wind LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Bayonne Energy Center, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Generation Owners	Helix Ravenswood LLC	D'Andrea, James	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Other Suppliers	BJ Energy LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Citigroup Energy Inc.	Trayers, Barry	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Con Edison Solutions Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Constellation New Energy		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DC Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	DTE Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Spectrum		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EnerNoc		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Galt Power	Ackerman, Alan	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	HQ Energy Services US	Plante, Matthieu	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Joseph, Kelli	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Ontario Power Generation, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Wentlent, Chris	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Fromer, Howard	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	SESCO Enterprises, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Shell Energy North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BP Energy Company		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	EDF Trading North America, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	NextEra Energy	Schwall, Matt	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Innoventive Power		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Vitol Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Viridity Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Riverbay Corporation		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BlueRock Energy, Inc.		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00

Sector	Organization	Representative	Affiliate	Present	For	Against
Other Suppliers	Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Energy Technology Savings		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Younger, Mark	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	New York Transco		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Talen Energy		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	CPower		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	XO Energy NY, LP		N	N	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Dynergy Marketing and Trade	Roby, Rick	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	LaRoe, Chris	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	Eastern Generation	Baker, Liam	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Other Suppliers	BioUrja Power, LLC		N	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Caletka, Patricia	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Borchert, John	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Butler, Scott	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	National Grid	Janzen, Margaret	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
Transmission Owners	Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.		Y	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Alcoa, Inc.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	IBM Corporation	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Occidental Chemical Corp.	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Wegmans Food Markets	Mager, Michael	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Consumer	Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Brew, James	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Large Cons. Gov. Agency	Metropolitan Transportation Authority		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	American Sugar Refining, Inc	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Beth Israel Health Care System	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Fordham University	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Mount Sinai Medical Center	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	New York University	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	0.00	0.00
End Use - Small Consumer	Association for Energy Affordability		N	N	0.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. State-wide Cons. Advocate	Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Hogan, Erin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Hall, Christopher	N	Y	1.00	0.00
End Use - Gov. Sm. Cons. & Retail Aggr.	City of New York	Lang, Kevin	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	Long Island Power Authority	Clarke, Dave	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - State Power Authorities	New York Power Authority	Antinori, Andrew	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Freeport Electric	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Lake Placid Village	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Municipal Commission of Boonville	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Westfield	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Solvay	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Arcade	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Fairport	Bolbrock, Richard	N	Y	0.00	1.00
Public Power - Munis & Co-ops	Village of Rockville Centre	Rudebusch, Tom	N	Y	1.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Lung Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	American Wind Energy Association		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Advocates	Bambrick, Conor	N	Y	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Natural Resources Defense Council		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	PACE Energy & Climate Center		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Riverkeeper		N	N	0.00	0.00
Public Power - Environmental	Environmental Defense Fund		N	N	0.00	0.00

New York Independent System Operator - Committee Membership
Business Issues Committee - November 15, 2017 - KCC - Parties Checked in Attendance

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Astoria Energy LLC	Generation Owners	McCall, Chuck	Browne , Scott	Habib , Phillipe	Singer, Leonard						
Bayonne Energy Center, LLC	Generation Owners	Allman , Ellen	Yang , Sue								
CPV Valley LLC	Generation Owners	✓Litchfield , Matt	Rumsey , Tom								
Calpine	Generation Owners	Kruse, Brett	Reitmeyer , Jay	Flumerfelt, John	Schleimer , Steve						
Cricket Valley Energy Center	Generation Owners	De Meyere , Bob	Wallenstein , Arnold	Paryl , Ron							
EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owners	Brodbeck , John	Kaplan , Seth	Nemeth , Jeffrey	✓High , Jeremy						
East Coast Power, LLC	Generation Owners	Shanker, Roy	Fogarty , Thomas	Lee , Tina	Franzetti , Paul						
Entergy Nuclear Northeast	Generation Owners	Dell Orto , Ken	✓Saia, Doreen	Bergeron , John							
Helix Ravenswood LLC	Generation Owners	✓D'Andrea , James	Kline , Marc	DiBari , Dominic							
Howard Wind LLC	Generation Owners	Merich , Olivia	Rugh , Chris								
Indeck Energy Services, Inc.	Generation Owners	Ferguson, Mike	✓Younger, Mark								
Innovative Energy Systems	Generation Owners	Zeliff, Peter	Henningham, Scott								
Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owners	Pakula , Maggie	Goldstein , Michael	Orzel , Chris							
National Grid Generation LLC	Generation Owners	Kain , Terrence	McCabe , Brian								
Noble Environmental Power LLC	Generation Owners	Silton , Harry									
Selkirk Cogen Partners, LP	Generation Owners	Biittig, Timothy	Ryan , James								
Somerset Operating Company, LLC	Generation Owners	Evanoski , Dave	✓Goodenough , Jeery	McManus , John							
BJ Energy LLC	Other Suppliers	Ni, Bing	Lee, George								
BP Energy Company	Other Suppliers	Briscoe , Judy	Magruder , Kathy								
BioUrja Power, LLC	Other Suppliers	Moore , Cody	Ward , Roxie								
BlueRock Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Nichols , Jim	Yeager , Keith	VanHorne , Phil	Graham , Tammy						
Brookfield Energy Marketing L.P.	Other Suppliers	✓LaRoe , Chris	Mitreski , Aleksandar	Mitelman , Rimma	Dallaire , Eric						
CPower	Other Suppliers	Dotson-Westphalen , Peter	Hourihan , Michael	Damaskos , Deno	Campbell , Bruce						
Castleton Commodities Merchant Trading L.P.	Other Suppliers	Stuss , Gordon	Romine , Brad	Emmett , Robert							
Citigroup Energy Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Trayers, Barry									
Con Edison Solutions Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Mah, Norman	Dannels , Jeff								
Constellation New Energy	Other Suppliers	Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven								
Cross Sound Cable Company, LLC	Other Suppliers	Reinhart, Brian	Rotger, Jose								
DC Energy	Other Suppliers	Bleiweis, Bruce	Stevens, Andrew	Tate, Matthew	Milberg, Sadao	Jeev , Kumar					
DTE Energy	Other Suppliers	Pakela, Gregory	Wieszczyk, Raymond	German , Robert							
Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC	Other Suppliers	Philips , Marjorie	Comstock , Read								
Dyegy Marketing and Trade	Other Suppliers	✓Roby , Rick	Ellis, Dean	Ziegler , Pete							
EDF Trading North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Erbrick , Michael	LeForce , Randall								
Eastern Generation	Other Suppliers	✓Baker, Liam	Reese, John	✓Younger, Mark	✓Schwall , Matthew	Johnson , David	✓Wolcott , Tyler				
EnerNoc	Other Suppliers	Brewster, David	Geller , Greg								
Energy Spectrum	Other Suppliers	David, Gary	Ahrens, David	Neiburg, David	Iskowitz, Aron	Brown, Ruben	Pentland , William	Villegas , Cristina	Cinadr , Matt		
Energy Technology Savings	Other Suppliers	Hendler , Jeff	Ross , Valerie								
Exelon Generating Co. LLC	Other Suppliers	Wentlent, Chris	Kirk , Steven							✓Wentlent, Chris	
GDF Suez Energy NA, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Levine , Jeffrey	Hawkins , Darin	Campbell , Chad							
Galt Power	Other Suppliers	Fernands , Rochelle	✓Ackerman, Alan								
HQ Energy Services US	Other Suppliers	✓Plante , Matthieu	✓Leuthauser, Scott	Guilbault , Louis							
Innoventive Power	Other Suppliers	Gruber , Craig	Halford , Steve								
Lyonsdale Biomass, LLC	Other Suppliers	Ralston , William	Hebel , Nathan	Carrigan , Kathleen							
Mercuria Energy America, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Davis , Andrew	✓Younger, Mark								
Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Murray, Patrick	Kochonies, Karen	Ezickson, Doron							
NRG Power Marketing Inc.	Other Suppliers	✓Joseph , Kelli	Fuller , Peter	Cona , Lisa							
New York Transco	Other Suppliers	Nachmias, Stuart	Hitti , Nabil	Caso , Rob	Carrigan , Kathleen	Dumais , Paul	McKinney , Jeff				
NextEra Energy	Other Suppliers	Applebaum, David	Gardner , Michelle	Gibelli , Stephen						✓Schwall, Matt	
Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp.	Other Suppliers	Boston , Roy	Kyle , Chris	Sunga , Leonard							
Ontario Power Generation, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Lacivita, Ken	Gell, Richard	Barr, David							
PSEG Energy Resource & Trade, LLC	Other Suppliers	✓Fromer, Howard	DePillo , Raymond	Messmer , Robert	Murawski , James						
Riverbay Corporation	Other Suppliers	Merola , Peter	Ellison , Noel	Ahrens, David	Villegas , Cristina						
SESCO Enterprises, LLC	Other Suppliers	Schubiger, Michael	Thoresen, James								
Shell Energy North America, LLC	Other Suppliers	Picardi, Matt									
Talen Energy	Other Suppliers	Hohenshilt , Jennifer	Labella , Julie	Kershner , Zane	Klicker , Owen						
TransCanada Power Marketing, Ltd.	Other Suppliers	Cahill , Paul	Schuler , Richard	Murphy , Tonya							
Viridity Energy, Inc.	Other Suppliers	Freifeld , Allen									
Vitol Inc.	Other Suppliers	Wadsworth , Joe	Viola , Bob	Kam , Kenney							
XO Energy NY, LP	Other Suppliers	Drangula , Carey	Thompson , Matthew	Hughes , Adam							

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Central Hudson Gas & Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	✓ Borchert , John	✓ Chan, Ting	May , Jeff	Dittmann, David						
Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc.	Transmission Owners	Quin , Jane	Nachmias, Stuart	✓ Butler , Scott	✓ Hargett , Chris	Butterklee, Neil					
National Grid	Transmission Owners	✓ Janzen , Margaret	Lodemore , David	Carron , Benjamin							
New York State Electric & Gas (NYSEG)	Transmission Owners	✓ Caletka, Patricia	Kinney, Ray	✓ Brophy , Richard							
Orange & Rockland Utilities, Inc.	Transmission Owners										
Rochester Gas and Electric Corp.	Transmission Owners	✓ Caletka, Patricia	Kinney, Ray	✓ Brophy , Richard							
Alcoa, Inc.	Large Consumer	✓ Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓ Lang, Kevin						
IBM Corporation	Large Consumer	✓ Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓ Lang, Kevin						
Nucor Steel Auburn, Inc.	Large Consumer	✓ Brew , James	Radigan, Frank	Kopon , Owen							
Occidental Chemical Corp.	Large Consumer	✓ Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓ Lang, Kevin						
Wegmans Food Markets	Large Consumer	✓ Mager, Michael	Loughney, Robert	Trinsey , Amanda	✓ Lang, Kevin						
Metropolitan Transportation Authority	Large Consumer Government Agency	Keller , David	Chou , Frances								
American Sugar Refining, Inc	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Association for Energy Affordability	Small Consumer	Morris, Jackson	Hepinstall, David	Strauss , Valerie							
Beth Israel Health Care System	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Fordham University	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Mount Sinai Medical Center	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
New York University	Small Consumer	Luthin, Catherine	Breidenbaugh , Aaron	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda					
Utility Intervention Unit, Division of Consumer Protection, NY Dept. of State	Government Statewide Consumer Advocate	✓ Hogan , Erin	✓ Montalvo , Marc	Kordonis , Dimitrios	Zimmerman , Michael						
City of New York	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	✓ Lang, Kevin	✓ Mager, Michael	Trinsey , Amanda							
NYS Energy Research & Dev. Authority	Government Small Consumer and Retail Aggregate	✓ Hall , Christopher	Coup, David	Mas , Carl	Wilcox , James	Matteson , Schuyler					
Long Island Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓ Clarke, Dave	✓ Wilczek , Mariann								
New York Power Authority	State Power Authorities	✓ Antinori , Andrew	Boyle, Bob	✓ Lundin , Tim	✓ Mahoney , Daniel						
Bath Electric, Gas & Water Systems	Municipalities and Coops	Hallgren , Guy	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Freeport Electric	Municipalities and Coops	Livingston , Al	Kimlingen, Ted	✓ Rudebusch, Tom	Fiore , Chris						
Jamestown Board of Public Utilities	Municipalities and Coops	Gustafson, David	Leathers, David	Kulig, Steve	✓ Rudebusch, Tom	Sellstrom , Kris					
Lake Placid Village	Municipalities and Coops	Kroha, Peter	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Municipal Commission of Boonville	Municipalities and Coops	Stabb, Kenneth	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Plattsburgh Municipal Lighting Dept	Municipalities and Coops	Treacy, William	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Arcade	Municipalities and Coops	Kilburn, Larry	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Fairport	Municipalities and Coops	Hegarty , Matt	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Rockville Centre	Municipalities and Coops	Andreas , Philip	Cardile , Thomas	✓ Rudebusch, Tom							
Village of Solvay	Municipalities and Coops	Hawksby , Joe	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
Village of Westfield	Municipalities and Coops	Thompson , Andrew	✓ Bolbrock, Richard	Cordeiro, Mark							
American Lung Association	Environmental	Epstein , Roni	Seilback, Michaek	Morris, Jackson							
American Wind Energy Association	Environmental	Reynolds , Anne	Gramlich, Robert	Beck , Betsy	Goggin , Michael	Gohn , Andrew	Grace , Gene				
Environmental Advocates	Environmental	✓ Bambrick , Conor	Epstein , Roni	Morris, Jackson							
Environmental Defense Fund	Environmental	Christian , Rory	Stein , Elizabeth								
Natural Resources Defense Council	Environmental	Farmer , Miles	Morris, Jackson	Viswanathan@nrdc.org , Kala							
PACE Energy & Climate Center	Environmental	Martin , Nicholas	Valova , Radina	Farmer , Miles							
Riverkeeper	Environmental	Gallay , Paul	Jones , Abigail	Doran , Erin							
AEP On-Site Partners, LLC	Non Voting	Jansen , Joel	Kakodkar , Guatam								
AES ES Holdings LLC	Non Voting	Hillman , Sharon	Kumaraswamy , Kiran								
Acadia Center	Non Voting	Howland , Jamie	Malone , Leslie								
Acadia Energy Corporation	Non Voting	Rappaport , Jason	Bay , John								
Advanced Energy Economy, Inc.	Non Voting	Katofsky , Ryan	Waggoner , Danny								
Advanced Migrogrid Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Jackson , Mike	Yamout , Manal								
Alliance for Clean Energy New York	Non Voting	Reynolds , Anne	Dufresne , Zach								
Anbaric Northeast Transmission Development Co.	Non Voting	Sanderson , Barry									
Appian Way Energy Partners East, LLC	Non Voting	Levy , Tal	Klein , Abram	Shen , Dong	Westlund , John	Laich , Marcus					
Ardor Energy LLC	Non Voting	Breen , Erika									
Boston Energy Marketing & Trading	Non Voting	Kramek , Mike									
Bruce Power	Non Voting	Viswanathan , Samira	Meyer , Sandra								
Caithness Energy LLC	Non Voting	Keevill , Gary	Alvarez , Asavari	Garber, Mitchell							
Calpine Energy Solutions	Non Voting	Sun , Jungsuk	Nakhonthap , Jade	Sunga , Leonard							
Canandaigua Power Partners, LLC	Non Voting	Keene , John	Gaddes , Caleb								
Chesapeake Trading Group, LLC	Non Voting	Staska , Stephanie	Hocker , Geoff								
Cubit Power One Inc.	Non Voting	Powell , Alan	Powell , Leighton	Singer, Leonard							

Organization	Sector	Representative	Alternate1	Alternate2	Alternate3	Alternate4	Alternate5	Alternate6	Alternate7	Proxy	Guest
Customized Energy Solutions	Non Voting	✓ Mancini, Rick	Fernands, Stephen	Rexrode, Caryn	✓ Ackerman, Alan						
Cypress Creek Renewables	Non Voting	Hyte, Noah	Salehian, Afshin								
Demand Energy Networks	Non Voting	Staker, Doug	Cook-Coyle, Jeff								
Earth Networks	Non Voting	Crawford, Jaden									
Energya VM	Non Voting	Garcia, Francisco	Maeso, Manual	Lopez, Ana	Silveira, Juan						
Fluent Energy	Non Voting	Acampora, Peter	Doll, Ed								
GI Energy	Non Voting	Falcier, Peter	Robinson, James								
Hudson River Energy Group	Non Voting	Radigan, Frank	Canfield, Richard								
Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Non Voting	Prevost, Michel									
ITC Mid-Atlantic Development LLC	Non Voting	Wrenbeck, Tom	Benedict, Nathan								
Iberdrola Renewables Inc	Non Voting	Allen, Thresa									
Innovari, Inc.	Non Voting	Lunt, Robin	Hodges, Brent								
Institute for Policy Integrity at NYU School of Law	Non Voting	Unel, Burcin	Noll, Bethany								
Key Capture Energy	Non Voting	Fitzgerald, Dan	Bishop, Jeff								
MAG Energy Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Pelletier, Simon	Veziina, Alexandre								
NRG Curtailment Solutions, Inc.	Non Voting	Popova, Julia	Ainspan, Malcolm	Pieniazek, Marie							
NY-BEST Consortium	Non Voting	Acker, William	Sheehan, Denise								
NYS Department of Public Service	Non Voting	Paynter, Thomas	✓ Evans, Adam								
National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation	Non Voting	Novak, Michael	Eck, Robert								
New Athens Generating Co. LLC	Non Voting	DeVinney, Dan									
Northeast Clean Heat & Power Initiative	Non Voting	Venkataraman, Sree	Lilian, Jon	Dwyer, Herb	Brown, Ruben	Cinadr, Matt	Martin, Nicholas	Villegas, Cristina			
Northline Utilities LLC	Non Voting	McKinney, Jeff	Danskin, Susan								
NuEnergien	Non Voting	Hamilton, Sandy	Korczykowski, Ryan								
Power Supply Services LLC	Non Voting	Phillips, Gabriel	✓ Abend, Erik								
RBC Energy Services, LP	Non Voting	Burnham, Steve	Fraiture, Christian	Doolittle, Robin							
RENEW Northeast	Non Voting	Pullaro, Francis	Krich, Abigail								
RES Americas, Inc.	Non Voting	Fernandes, John	Boyd, Dan								
Red Wolf Energy Trading, LLC	Non Voting	Sharma, Rishi									
Richard P. Felak	Non Voting	Felak, Rich									
STEM, Inc.	Non Voting	Ko, Ted									
Saracen Energy East LP	Non Voting	Peebles, Andy									
Siemens Energy, Inc.	Non Voting	Feltes, James									
SolarCity Corporation	Non Voting	Watson, Betty	Khan, Jamil	Reinhardt, Jessica							
Stephentown Spindle, LLC	Non Voting	Hebert, Chris									
Taylor Biomass Energy, LLC	Non Voting	Taylor, Jim	Page, Allan								
Tesla Motors, Inc.	Non Voting	Burson, Kate	Van Cleve, Sarah								
TransAlta Energy Marketing (U.S.) Inc.	Non Voting	Nivolianitis, Ted									
Transmission Developers Inc.	Non Voting	Jessome, Donald	Helmer, William	Dave, Suresh							
Transource New York, LLC	Non Voting	Burkholder, Joshua									
William P. Short	Non Voting	Short, William	Schaefer, Marc		Savage, Paul	Verna, Jim					